



OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

MATT CARLUCCI, SR.
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4
OFFICE (904) 255-5218
ECA (904) 255-5159
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

**RE: CRO Resiliency Presentation & Noticed Meeting
with CMs DeFoor, Morgan, Boylan, Dennis & Carlucci**
Tuesday, April 12, 2022
12:00 P.M.

Location: Council Chamber

Attendees:

CM Matt Carlucci	Chuck Smithers	Guillermo Simon	Barbara Renfroe
CM Joyce Morgan	Bruce Fouraker	John Burr	Dr. Josh Gellers
CM Randy DeFoor	Ann Schrader	Kelly Rich	Molly Brady
CM Michael Boylan	Gloria Teague	Wes Wolfe	Jim Schwartz
CM Garrett Dennis	Lisa Sterling	Beth Payne	Bill Hoff
Anne Coglianese	Brandon Rivers	Amanda Polematidis	Kelly Doyle
Rachel Zimmer	Steve Swann	Angela DeMonbreun	Barbara Ketchum
John Pappas	Carolyn Rosenberry	Stephanie Freeman	Ashantae Green
Carlo Fassi	Terry Rosenberry	Sean Lahav	Barbara Gubbin
Bill Killingsworth	Steve Patterson	Corey Perrine	Joey McKinnon
Adam Rosenblatt	Logan Cross	Dr. Quinton White	John Nooney
Joe Loretta	Tina Nichols	Carole Hawkins	
James Richardson	Adam Hoyles	Deborah Early	
Faura Ilami	Mark Green	Brooks Andrews	

NOTE: approximately 70 attended.

Video Link: <https://jaxcityc.granicus.com/player/clip/4100>

Meeting Convened: 12:05 PM

CM MORGAN

Good afternoon, everyone. It's about five minutes after 12. We're gonna go ahead and get started because we know this is your lunchtime and you might want to grab a bite to eat, as well as enjoy this presentation today. My name is CM Joyce Morgan. I currently serve as the Chair of the TEU Committee which is Transportation, Energy, and Utilities.

But I also had the esteemed pleasure of serving with these five people that you all know on our Special Committee on Resiliency and serving as a subcommittee chair for our community outreach and engagement. So, we are so excited to have you all here today in one room and in person. How about that! I know right? How many weeks and months did we do this? And can we did it all by Zoom. But again, I know we've thanked you a thousand times, but we have to thank you just one more time for



OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

MATT CARLUCCI, SR.
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4
OFFICE (904) 255-5218
ECA (904) 255-5159
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

being on those Zoom calls for so many months. So, thank you. Thank you! That shows your true commitment to the City of Jacksonville, to resiliency, and to changing our city. During that time, we all talked about one thing: getting a chief resiliency officer. And we talked about what that would look like and what that would mean to our city to have a chief resiliency officer. Well, now we have that. And the other thing we talked about is bringing all of us—who had worked so hard on so many items to get ready for this officer to come in—we wanted to make sure that we all had an invitation to come in together to meet and talk to this officer. Now, I know you've all met her already, but that's okay. We still have a treat for you today. And so, I just wanted to welcome you all and just say thank you again and bring up our Chair of our Resiliency Committee. And that was the second chair, our friend CM DeFoor.

CM DEFOOR

Thank you. Thank you. Well, what a great turnout. Again, we're just gonna thank you throughout this whole presentation because we couldn't have done this without you. That's just the bottom line. So, we want to thank our subject matter experts. Can you stand? All that participated. Because it's really powerful to see how many of you are here today. And I'm just gonna give you another round of applause. [applause]

I want to thank you all. I want to thank our city officials that are here and my esteemed colleagues. I am proud of what this committee accomplished. Just to kind of hit the highlights on it, our special committee work resulted in more than, believe it or not, 50 public meetings. That is a lot. We had 30 guest speakers, and we had, of course as you all know, those three subcommittees that comprised more than 40 subject matter experts from our community. And as a result of that, we ended up with a 96-page report—a very, very powerful report. This work, and the publication, could not have been done without all of you. Your work was impeccable and much needed. And as a result of that, as my colleague stated, we ended up having the position of Chief Resiliency Officer codified. It was not codified before. We also amended the conservation and coastal management element of the 2030 Comprehensive Plan of the City of Jax to address resiliency planning through the Adaptation Action Area Report. But I have to say that codification of the CRO strikes me as one of the most important outcomes of this committee. We're excited to be here today and to hear from her for the first time to address our committee. And with that, I'm going to hand it over to my colleague, Councilman Matt Carlucci, who started this whole process. Please welcome him.

CM CARLUCCI

Well, it's my job to introduce this young lady, and I can give you the long version of the bio which is about 10 pages. But I'll just say that she's very qualified and I can give you the short version. I think she would prefer the short version, but I will say this, I thank everybody for your participation in this whole process. And I think you would have been amazed if you'd been here and seen how, at our very first



OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

MATT CARLUCCI, SR.
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4
OFFICE (904) 255-5218
ECA (904) 255-5159
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

meeting, we said that we would be hiring a chief resiliency officer within, hopefully, a year. And... promises made, promises kept. And you, [gestured to CRO] came along and filled those shoes and are doing a great job. So, without further ado.... we had a great committee. It was a fun time Everybody was involved, and now here's our Chief Resiliency Officer.

Anne Coglianesse, that's a good Italian name and that's one of the things that tipped it over the top for me. [laughter] Anne Coglianesse is the Chief Resilience Officer for the City of Jacksonville. In this capacity, Anne leads the development of resilience initiatives to ensure Jacksonville can adapt and thrive in the face of acute shocks and chronic stresses brought on by climate change. Prior to joining the City of Jacksonville, Anne served as the Coastal Resilience Manager for the City of New Orleans where she implemented nature-based solutions to sea-level rise and coastal land loss. Anne's previous experience also includes serving at the White House Council on Environmental Quality, where she participated in the development of climate adaptation and resilience policies to meet the Obama Administration's resilience goals.

So, I'm very happy to introduce and come on up and you can make your presentation I thank you so much for being willing to spend this time with this wonderful group of people who care about our city.

CRO COGLIANESE

Hi, everyone. This is a room full of a lot of friendly faces. I'm excited that this is not the first time most of you are getting to see me. I think that shows. You know we've had a drumbeat of action since Day One. And I'm like I'm excited to kind of share what we've done so far and kind of what we're teeing up for the next couple years.

So, anyone who's seen me present before knows that I like to start every presentation with a definition of resilience. I think resilience can mean different things to different people. So, before we get too in the weeds, I wanted to just make sure that we're aware that we're when we're talking about resilience in this context, we're talking about city resilience, and I defined that as the ability of city systems to adapt and thrive in the face of acute shocks and chronic stresses. And if you'll notice, I also threw up the definition that this committee put in your report, and I think there's a lot of overlaps there. And I don't need to tell this to you all, but you know, acute shock is a hurricane or chronic stress is something slow moving like sea level rise. And the one piece of this definition that I latch on to the most is that we're talking about adaptation and thriving in the same breath.

So, I think often resilience is seen as a way to address risk. And it is, but I think there's so much more that we can do by viewing resilience as an opportunity to look at the future that we want for Jacksonville and figure out what we need to do to get us there. One more thing that I'd like to define at



OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

MATT CARLUCCI, SR.
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4
OFFICE (904) 255-5218
ECA (904) 255-5159
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

the offset and then I'll get into kind of giving you a more robust update is that I like to talk about the concept of a resilience dividend. And that's basically how are we achieving multiple benefits with every public dollar that we're spending. And so, if you look in the top left corner, you'll see a stormwater park that's actually in New Orleans and that helps take pressure off of the drainage system reduce street level flooding during major rain events. But and then that could be an intervention that we end up applying here in Jacksonville. But I think it's important to think about how are we not just addressing the flooding? How are we seeing that stormwater Park and the value that it provides when it's not raining? What kind of recreation do we want there? And where's this being built? Is it near a school? Or is there a way that we can get school students to come visit this park and learn about the connection between Jacksonville and its environment? And also, who's designing this and who's building this? How are we setting up Jacksonville firms to be successful and going after these bids and making sure that the economic benefits of spending this public funding are really felt throughout the community. So that's just a little academic work before we get into kind of our main update.

I know you all care about is, kind of, where are we going from here? And the main thing we're working on is developing comprehensive resilience strategy, much like what most other cities in the country have. I'm excited because I think we will be able to get to a place where we have policies, projects and programs that address resilience in all facets of our community writ large. And also, it's important to just at the outset to make sure you all understand this will be developed in part by me but with a lot of coordination from city staff, city leadership, the independent authorities that operate here in Jacksonville, obviously city council, stakeholders, much like yourselves and then the general public, just to make sure that this this strategy really does speak to the community writ large. And to help with this work. We've been able to put out an RFP and bring on an amazing team of consultants led by the Water Institute of the Gulf which is a resilience and science-based planning firm. They have also they've brought on fern leaf, which is a data analytics firm, and you'll hear a bit more about their work later scape which is a resilience design and landscape architecture firm. And then we have two fantastic local firms EDG which does engagement Outreach and Communications and half an Associates which does engineering and planning work. And I believe we have a number of members of the half team here if you guys want to stand up or give a wave. We're really excited that you guys will be a part of this, and we'll have some overlap.

So, this is the framework that we're operating off of to guide most of the work that we'll be doing. And I thought this could be kind of a good framework to which we structure our conversation today. So, with any good planning process, the step one is having a vision really where do we want our community to be? What are our goals and our values? And luckily, we aren't starting at square one on this. There have been so many efforts underway already. From the adaptation Action Area process run out of the planning department in 2018 to the storm resiliency and infrastructure review committee or



OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

MATT CARLUCCI, SR.
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4
OFFICE (904) 255-5218
ECA (904) 255-5159
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

development review committee that was set up in 2019. And then obviously, the impact that you all had with the council Special Committee on resiliency. And so that's really helpful in kind of combing through those different efforts and consolidating them as we move into the next phase which is how we're analyzing our risk. So, we have a pretty good picture of what Jacksonville's risks are right, we're at risk to flooding and that's flooding from sea level rise from storm surge from extreme high tide from extreme rainfall. We know that heat is a vulnerability, that high wind can be a vulnerability. What we're what we're trying to do now is get some measurements of that so part of this was done with the update of the Adaptation Action Area coastal high hazard map. And this is based on FEMA. It's also being updated as some work that we're that the city is doing with CDM Smith gets underway to refine what we're looking at the hazard area.

We're also conducting a major vulnerability assessment with CDM Smith out of the City's Public Works department to map 59 major tributaries and their basins here in Jacksonville and this is gonna give us the most complete picture of our flood risks. Available. Ordinarily, I would not go into the weeds on this, but I have a feeling that this group will actually be interested in this. So, I'm throwing up a table that shows the different variables that are going into the model that CDM Smith is running, and I wanted to make sure that folks here were aware we're looking at we're looking at rainfall we're looking at fluctuations in tide, we're looking at surge and we're looking at sea level rise, but we're doing that for our kind of our current conditions. We're then modeling out to 2040, 2070, and 2100. So that we have a picture of not only what's our risk now, but where's it going to go and that can be a guiding force. In how we make decisions going forward.

I'm also really excited to share that we have an upcoming heat study that will be done in partnership with UNF and Kapha strategies. Adam Rosenblatt Are you here. Adam over there is that is our kind of lead researcher for this at UNF really excited to announce this as the first chance I've had to talk about it publicly. But we will be gathering data during the hottest Week of the 2022 summer. There's sensors that will be attached to cars and they will run predesigned routes throughout the city multiple times a day every day for a week. And then at the end of that week. We're able to aggregate that data and get a base layer in GIS that shows where air temperatures are hottest throughout the city and again that can help us guide interventions. I'm kind of in the bottom corner of this slide. I threw up a couple of statistics about heat. I think often we focus on flooding because it's the most financially damaging threat that we have it can really impact property and have a high price tag. But ultimately urban heat is the deadliest natural hazard that that we face. And that's based across the country. It takes more lives, every year, than hurricanes, wildfires, or tornadoes. So, it's really a kind of a slow-moving hazard but one that I'm very focused on and want to make sure that we have kind of a drumbeat of action on and the data layer that's going to come out of this partnership with you and that will be really helpful to us.



OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

MATT CARLUCCI, SR.
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4
OFFICE (904) 255-5218
ECA (904) 255-5159
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

The next piece is kind of once we have the flood data once you have some of this key data, how are we maximizing it and finding ways to use it and this is where the firm for neat will be building out an Excel for assets around the city, compare them with different threats and then determine what the vulnerability and risk is on a personal level. So, this will be really granular risk data that we can use to make decisions. And the type of assets they'll be looking at are everything from residential to commercial to industrial, government owned facilities, critical facilities for the community, and cultural and historic hubs and also business impact. And then the threats are much of the same threats that we've that I just discussed in kind of some of our data gathering work, and they'll be incorporated into this tool. And it's this tool that can do a lot and so I wanted to just drill down on a couple of this a couple of examples of how this can be useful and how it's been useful in other cities.

The City of Charleston has an Excel adapt tool and one of the things that it was able to really help them figure out is what are areas that I mean, certainly what are areas that are at risk for flooding, but also what are areas that will be impacted if flooding happens elsewhere. And so, on the left you can see kind of business level information that's incorporated into the parcels and that's anything from numbers of employees to annual sales volumes. And that gives us kind of an additional lens to understand businesses that may be vulnerable to flooding. So, when we aggregate this to a neighborhood scale, it helps us identify areas where kind of a disproportionate numbers of employees might move wages or tax revenues might be impacted due to businesses needing to close down during a storm event. And then this helps us prioritize actions in parts of the city where livelihoods and kind of economic vitality might be most affected without action taken.

And then on to the right. You'll see a neighborhood and kind of an example of how the Excel adapt tool can help us identify critical access points. So, in the neighborhood in this photo, the homes are actually not at risk to flooding. But as you can see in that yellow circle, the there's one entry point into this area that is vulnerable to flooding. And so that can impact residents' ability to get out to go to work to you know, visit businesses but also it impacts emergency response vehicles ability to get in. And so again, those are one of the things that often we can't we don't get a sense of that when we're looking at slightly a zoomed-out scale. And so the fact that we'll be able to incorporate our city wide data with this more granular data and have it in a very user friendly tool for city staff to make decisions off of is really going to be a game changer and we're very excited to see this tool built out and then the final the final deliverable of the tool is one an online portal that city staff can use and can see that granular you know piece of information but also it's very easy for us then to extract pieces of this data and form very readable documentation and content that we can use for public engagement and outreach.

One thing I anticipate that might be of interest to the folks in the front row over here is we can then break out by every council district. What are the major risks and what are the major points of



OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

MATT CARLUCCI, SR.
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4
OFFICE (904) 255-5218
ECA (904) 255-5159
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

vulnerability for every council district so that council members have a sense of what they need to be focusing on and prioritizing for their communities. And so, it's just great that we'll have an ability to just seamlessly aggregate that data and then pull out what's usable for different folks. That's kind of our risk piece. And then we get into the resilience opportunities. And again, there's a lot that's already been done here, but it's an important step in the process, nonetheless. So, this is really where we identify every possible intervention that can help address the issues that were drawn out through the risk process. A lot of that can come from the existing plans that we have and the robust process that this this group undertook, but there's also this gives us an opportunity to flesh out some new ideas to pull best practices from other cities and start to workshop how applicable they might be here in Jacksonville. This will also be the step in the process where we can start to center different ideas around kind of different geographies or different themes.

So, the image that I have up here in on this slide is actually from Houston's resilient strategy, which was developed by the Water Institute of the Gulf, which is the same firm that we're using for this work, and it focused this image centers around how Easton is managing its network of by us they have a network of buyers in the same way that we have networks of tributaries here in Jacksonville. And so, you know, on part of that there's water quality and a need for habitat restoration. But they also incorporate in this image, the need for trails a place a way for people to recreate ELive home elevations or in some places, home buyouts places is an opportunity for public art. So those are all things that might feel disconnected at times, but because they're all present in the bayou geography, they get clustered together and that's how we're able to find some of those co benefits or that resilience dividend.

This is the piece I think I'm most excited about in our in the framework that we're undertaking, and that's an Alternatives Analysis. And this is where I think what Jacksonville is doing is going to go beyond what any other city has done with their resilience strategy. We're really going to be looking at it you know, when you take the full suite of possible interventions, and then you start to weigh, you know, how effective is this going to be and actually achieving our goals. And because we've done robust data gathering at the outset, offset will have the ability to actually go back and weigh the pros and cons of different approaches. So, this can really help us make sure that the scale of actions we're proposing are actually going to lead to the scale of impact we need. You know, if we had if we said we're gonna address urban flooding, and we built one green infrastructure Park, then are we actually addressing urban flooding across Jacksonville? No. So we have to kind of make sure that we're able to prove the value of the different projects we have.

And so, the graphic that I have on this slide is it's not from a resilient strategy. It's actually from a climate action effort that was stood up in Louisiana, but it's one of the few examples that I'm able to find of where this alternative analysis has really been done. A way to kind of take participatory conversations,



OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

MATT CARLUCCI, SR.
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4
OFFICE (904) 255-5218
ECA (904) 255-5159
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

but really start to weigh the costs and benefits of those. And then the other example I wanted to pull from is actually from the state of Louisiana's coastal Master Plan, which I had the opportunity to work on a lot when I was working for New Orleans. And the thing I really liked about the state's master plan is they have a data viewer that shows and kind of the top image. It shows what the Louisiana coast flood risk would look like under a medium scenario of sea level rise with a 100-year storm event if no action was taken. And then the picture below is the same conditions. But if the state's master plan is implemented in full and you can see that the risk does drop and so I think this is another reason why our Alternatives Analysis step is so important, because it's our chance to show that we that the interventions we're proposing will actually yield the benefit we want. And obviously this is a radically different scale than then the work we're going to be doing. But I think it's a good illustration of the fact that we should be able at the offset onset to actually prove the value that this will have in the long run and that you know, we'll see the resilience and the risk benefits once implemented.

And then finally, it all comes down to prioritization and publishing a resilient strategy with different actions. And I know that there's a lot of I've heard this from some of the members of this audience and from people across Jacksonville, there's a bit of hesitancy about why we are making another document we've already we've already written documents, reports just sit on a shelf. And so, I really want to kind of give you a tour of what I'm meaning when I'm saying strategy and how detailed this will look and how it will actually be a guiding document. So, this is from the Houston resilience strategy again, and I wanted to pull out kind of the legend that's in that yellow box there. It shows which shocks and stresses each action is addressing the timeframe it'll be implemented on who are the key stakeholders involved. Ours will also include what's the budget for this? What's the funding stream that's going to be attached so we're kind of taking lessons from other cities, and we're going a little bit beyond that. Similarly, in the Houston strategy, they had one major action that was to update their building codes and standards, but then you can see here where those arrows are, there are numerous, very detailed and very descriptive steps within that process. So, this final document will be very tangible, very action oriented. And we'll also hopefully be able to develop a matrix similar to this that'll track what are what all of these projects are aiming to achieve and kind of when they're where they are in their implementation process, not only for us as city staff to make sure that we're keeping a drumbeat of action, but also so that members of the public know what we're doing. Council members are aware of kind of where we are in this process.

So, I know I just threw a lot at you with that with that framework. But I know that this is a group that cares a lot about the details. So, I wanted to get into our work plan just a little bit to give you a timeframe. We are actively in the first phase of this work right now. Kind of combining the visioning and the risk assessment pieces, getting the Excel adapt tool ready to go. We're expecting that we'll be able to launch around August



OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

MATT CARLUCCI, SR.
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4
OFFICE (904) 255-5218
ECA (904) 255-5159
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

and starting to figure out what our measurable objectives are and kind of some of the key metrics that we'll be using. Also, by the end of the summer, we're hoping we'll be able to have some public engagement materials that'll explain kind of the participatory process that we do phase two, and this will be where we do the resilience opportunities. The alternatives, analysis and some of that initial priority setting, highly participatory. This will be where we're able to kind of do that analysis and refine our ideas and start to call down the list of interventions that we're going to take on. And then finally, our third phase is to publish the strategy and the hope is that we'll be able to finish kind of phase two by next spring and so early, late spring, early next summer, the final strategy will be published and that will include a kind of a dashboard or a matrix or some sort of tracking tool.

And you'll see kind of at the bottom of all of these slides, there's a stakeholder and public engagement kind of dotted line I want to make it clear that this is something that will not be happening in a vacuum. This is going to need to be a very participatory process at each step of it. And there'll be internal city staff, city leadership, there's also going to be a need to engage with subject matter experts, civic leaders, and obviously, the general public. And so, some of this may take place in workgroup meetings, other than public meetings, and I'm sure that there'll be a component of survey data that's also incorporated to make sure we get as many voices in this in this process is possible.

Just to go back one slide. We have this is the process is going to tell us all of the resilience initiatives that we that we tackle from kind of capital infrastructure projects to policy changes to kind of new programs that we need to stand up. However, with there are a couple of things that we know right off the bat, we're going to need to tackle and there are about two, two plus year planning processes. One is an update to the city's land development regulations within the planning department. So, what are we permitting where we permitting it? How are we factoring in our climate projections into what the city approves and with respect to private development, so we're gonna get that underway kind of concurrent to this resilient strategy process. We don't want to wait until the final strategy is published before we start tackling these very big questions. And because we expect that this is going to need to be kind of its own robust process of updating the regulations. We want to give as much time for that as possible.

And then similarly, I think if we're if we are saying we're going to, you know change the regulations on how private development is built to factor in climate risk, I also think it's very important that the way the city is designing for climate is taken into account. So, we'll be working with the Department of Public Works to update design standards to make sure that every city project is considering climate is considering future projections of risk in how they're in there, how they're designed from the get goes that kind of every dollar in our CIP at some step in the process has been considered for climate risk just to make sure we're making the smartest financial decisions in construction.



OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

MATT CARLUCCI, SR.
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4
OFFICE (904) 255-5218
ECA (904) 255-5159
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

And I think to get back to the point I made earlier about people being concerned that we're building another document... we're doing a strategy I want to make it clear that this is really the foundation layer in standing up a sustainable Resilience Program writ large. So, before we can get into kind of a drumbeat of action on implementation, it's really clear that we have a defined budget a defined scope, clear project teed up, that there's kind of a timeline for how that'll be implemented, that we can track our progress and measure our success. And also, that we're clearly institutionalizing resilience planning into city processes. I think, if every departments kind of doing that differently, or if the way the city's thinking about resilience differs from the way some of our independent authorities are the that's going to lead to confusion. So, I think this planning process will hopefully get everyone aligned and moving in the same direction, so that that program has longevity.

And I know I've thrown a lot at you, but one last slide I'm going to throw up here. I don't want people to think that just because we're undertaking this comprehensive, resilient strategy process that we're gonna wait and we won't do anything. Until then we are aggressively pursuing grants and funding opportunities for resilience in the in the here and now. We've applied for 500,000 in state funding to support the vulnerability assessment work that public works and CDM Smith are doing and we're optimistic we'll get that we also received \$21.3 million in state resilient Florida resilient Florida grant program funding, and that's going to two capital improvement plan projects. The vulnerability assessment work that public works and CDM Smith are doing when it's completed if we submit that data to the state, we will then qualify for the statewide flooding and sea level rise resilience grant. And that is a bucket of \$1 million. That's available annually for resilience projects.

So, the steps that we're doing, they're not only good for us to make smart decisions, they're also giving us access to more resources. And then finally, I know it's not the flashiest dollar amount, but we're really excited that we were able to secure a NOAA grant to support the UNSC study with kappa strategies. I think it shows a drumbeat of you know, local action, federal priorities, private sector technology, and then academic thought and research. So, I'm really excited about that program. And in general, I think we're really preparing ourselves to put Jacksonville in the best position forward going forward, both to address risk and then really take advantage of the opportunities that are out there.

So, thank you all for listening to kind of my data dump of what we're doing and where we're going, and I would be happy to answer any questions that folks have. [applause]

CM DEFOOR

Boy, that was incredible. I mean, I had not seen that. How many of you have seen that presentation? Is it the first time you've done it?



OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

MATT CARLUCCI, SR.
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4
OFFICE (904) 255-5218
ECA (904) 255-5159
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

I mean, I don't know about you, but the whole Houston slide where she talked about bringing together eco-tourism, basically, and public art, and all the name of resiliency. That's very powerful. It made me think of the Emerald Trail. So, one day will be the slide that other people can see, right. I was gonna ask if that last slide was Riverside Avenue, but I don't think it was. The other thing I thought was incredible—and then I want to go to the questions—is the fact that you're going to identify deliverables. And with that, we get a return on investment. And finally, the dashboard so we're, you know, we're being the city is going to be held accountable for those deliverables. And I think that's, I think that's incredibly powerful as well.

So, with that, let's open up for questions. I know we had a couple of speakers. We have Adam Boyd. Adam, where are you? There you are, and after Adam will be Carol. Where are you, Carol? Okay.

ADAM HOYLES

Well, thank you. Great presentation, loved the work. You know, and a lot of hard work went into this, and this is kind of what we and what the city was needing and looking for. And on the resiliency thing, I think that it's really important to highlight to our leadership that every dollar we're spending on resiliency has a return on investment. That it—I think I heard on the radio the other day—was like six to one. So, you know, when you're talking to city leadership and saying we need to spend X million dollars on this or that, that's a big deal, because that's money you don't have to spend saving people after the fact or fixing things after the fact. The city gets to still function after a disaster. And we're not as impacted. So, anyway, very proud of your work, very proud of what you're doing, and very much appreciate what you're doing for the city, and I hope that the city sustains the leadership that you're bringing to the table because the city needs it. Anyway, thank you.

CM DEFOOR

All right, Carol. You know, one thing that you stated about changing the construction requirements, you know, it's so key because otherwise it's like insanity. We just keep doing the same things over and over again and expecting different results. So that, to me, is going to be a huge part of this as well.

COGLIANESE

Yeah, I mean, I think we have the benefit of how many other cities have already done resilience strategies instead of resilience programs. And I think a pitfall that I've been conscious to avoid is starting with pilot projects. I think a lot of cities will come up with a couple splashy infrastructure projects, and then get three or four years down the line and then realize what they really needed to do was, you know, three years ago change how they were constructing everything that was coming out of public regs. And so, I think, you know, they had new infrastructure that suddenly started flooding and they



OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

MATT CARLUCCI, SR.
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4
OFFICE (904) 255-5218
ECA (904) 255-5159
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

were like, well, why isn't that different? So, I think starting from a point of trying to make systemic changes first and then we can get into kind of what are the bigger infrastructure, new infrastructure needs that we have? I'm hope that that's something we're able to learn from other places and kind of a pitfall we're able to sidestep a little bit.

CAROLE HAWKINS

Yeah, hi. Thank you. I appreciate that you came to speak with us today, Anne. And I just wanted to say I thought that you're very smart and very strategic in the way you're approaching it. I really was impressed by that. I live in Murray Hill. I'm speaking for myself personally, but I am aware of your work because of my work through ICARE, which has picked up environmental issues this year, and they were specifically focused on the work that the city is doing related to a flood vulnerability assessment. So, I'm glad that you mentioned that.

I have some questions about it. Because we had some trouble when we were trying to understand where we stood with all of that, getting the information that we needed to be really clear about what the status was and what might still be needed to go forward. This again, is, I know you know this, but maybe not everybody does. The 100 million dollars a year through resilient Florida, the state grant program that we'd like to be obviously eligible for adaptation projects statewide. And I can see that the work you're doing leads us to that but it's not clear to me which pieces complete it. The CDM Smith study looks like it gets us just about halfway there. It looks like we need to institute of Florida study to get those. The part I'm worried about okay, and I don't know for sure. So, you can correct me if I'm wrong. The part I don't see us getting this year is the Water Institute of the Gulf, the one that was going to give us the critical assets. And Resilient Florida does need that in order for us to be eligible for that grant money. So, it seems to me like the timeline on that is next year? I'm wondering, about when will we have what we need to be eligible for that grant? What's the timeline and are the funds in place to do those studies yet? And if not, where will the money come from?

COGLIANESE

Great question. So, the funding for the consultant work is part of the budget that I'm able to manage and that the Administration was able to secure for me coming in and so that that at least is taken care of. I do want to clarify the Resilient Florida Grant Program. It is something that we qualify for. In fact, that's where the \$21.3 million grant we got last year was. The one that's \$100 million and does have vulnerability assessment requirements and, kind of, strings to it, is the statewide Flooding And Sea Level Rise, Resilience Planning Grant. And so, we are teeing up to have that vulnerability assessment done by about August and this grant doesn't open until September. Or I think it opens in July and it closes in September. So, we should have that data completed and to the state in time to apply for that pot of funding.



OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

MATT CARLUCCI, SR.
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4
OFFICE (904) 255-5218
ECA (904) 255-5159
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

HAWKINS

[off mic, indecipherable]

COGLIANESE

So, in the first phase of the vulnerability assessment, it mapped six high priority basins. And it did have critical asset mapping and then the hope is that the Excel adapt tool, which also should be completed by August should give us enough criteria to qualify for that. So yes, the hope is that this grant cycle we will be able to go after that pot of funding.

HAWKINS

[off mic, indecipherable]

COGLIANESE

The Water Institute of the Gulf is already working with us and they're already going to have that tool ready for us by August. So, it's all of it. It's all happening.

CM DEFOOR

John, you're next, and if anyone would like to ask questions, if you just would fill out the speaker card.

JOHN BURR

Yeah, thank you very much for the presentation. It was very impressive. Couple of things. It was so impressive that I would love to get a copy of the PowerPoint and I'm sure a lot of people here would. So, if you could tell us how to do that. And the other question was, Councilwoman DeFoor had mentioned that it was very important that, the job that you're doing, the Chief Resiliency Officer, was codified. Think I know the significance of being codified, but I'm not quite sure if you could explain that please.

CM DEFOOR

I'm happy to explain that. So, in other words, it's actually a standing position. It's not something that goes away. In other words, it's not subject necessarily to the budget. It's no different than Lori Boyer and her position I mean, so you don't necessarily have to fill the position, but at least it's codified. So that it is a reminding, you know, to this administration and any future administrations that it's something that we find to be very important and needed for our community. Thank you for the question.

All right. Any other questions? All right. I'll tell you what we're going to do because... Hey, Brooks. Brooks, come on up. Are you filling it out? Okay, that's okay. All right. You Oh, hey, how are you? People snuck in. [laughter]



OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

MATT CARLUCCI, SR.
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4
OFFICE (904) 255-5218
ECA (904) 255-5159
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

BROOKS ANDREWS

Hey, Anne. Thank you for the great presentation. Thank you to all the Council Members as well. And thank you for taking a tour with us for Riverside/Avondale to look at our flooding, vulnerability and other issues in our neighborhood a couple of weeks ago. My question for you is about a little more specificity about community engagement. At the end of the day—and excuse me, Council Members—but Council members act when they hear a lot from their constituents. Right? So, I'm wondering, what are some of your thoughts around how we gain greater citizen advocacy and that drumbeat, grassroots drumbeat, if you will, to encourage change, to support change, to make change happen with their vote, and put dollars behind these efforts? Interested in your thoughts. Thank you.

COGLIANESE

Sure. And I think kind of what I'll say is, when I went through our kind of our three phases of our work plan, and at the bottom, you saw that kind of dotted line that says, "stakeholder engagement." My hope is that we have public engagement on some level at every step of the process. For that first phase, when so much of that is the visioning work, a lot of that is going to pull from the stakeholder engagement that you all have done, the public engagement that the Planning department did. To really making sure that we're identifying themes and trends and things that are coming up time and time again from residents and building from there. And then I think as we start to get into identifying different projects that we might tackle, there's going to be a need for public engagement to both, kind of, give feedback on our possible projects, presenting new ideas that they might want to see, or give us feedback on what they're seeing in their community.

And then I think, you know, as we publish the strategy, I think my hope is that that's the most powerful tool available, because it'll be risk based and financially driven, but also a culmination of all of that participatory work and, and it will have this kind of metric and the dashboard that people can kind of easily understand where are we going, at what pace in, kind of, our planning queue is a project, and so I'm hopeful that going forward, that ends up being kind of a critical tool that the public can use to show their support for this. And to really continue driving a drumbeat of action and making sure that we're staying on target with all of the things that we are proposing to do.

CM DEFOOR
Ms. Green?

ASHANTAE GREEN

Hello, everyone, it is so nice to see you guys in person. I've seen your face on Zoom. But I definitely first want to congratulate our work and to give kudos to you because it's not an easy undertaking. Have a



OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

MATT CARLUCCI, SR.
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4
OFFICE (904) 255-5218
ECA (904) 255-5159
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

few statements and questions. I love that you are working to get, you know, a master plan together. I did come in a little late, so I'm not sure if you talked about timeline because it seems like a lot more research and planning. I wonder if you have a timeline for when some of the low-hanging fruit or any specific actionable things can be accomplished. That's the first question.

COGLIANESE

Yeah, absolutely. Well, to the low-hanging fruit, we're going after funding, allocating it in the here and now to projects that are already in the CIP that we know have significant resilience value. And we're moving forward on those types of initiatives. And then the, kind of, research phase for this work, you know, the kind of technical data gathering, we're hoping that'll be done by August, so it's not going to drag on too long. And then I think then kind of the next stage in the process will be really taking participatory, qualitative information that we're getting from stakeholders in the public and turning that into quantitative outcomes, actual tangible projects in the timeline. So, the whole comprehensive resilience strategy we're expecting will take roughly 18 months, so we're hoping kind of by the start of next summer, we should have or, you know, be well on our way to, or if not, have published a strategy. But I think at various steps in the next 18 months, people will feel a drumbeat of action, they will see what we're doing. This is not going to be done behind closed doors. And we're not waiting until the final strategy is published to do other projects and to, like you said, address low-hanging fruit

GREEN

Awesome. And last question is kind of a two-parter because I know a lot of us in this room worked very hard for 14 months on that report. My question was, how is the specific report being implemented? Is that useful to you? And the last part is we put a lot of attention on environmental justice and equity. I just want to make sure that we keep that synergy going and that we are using some of those education things we put in the report, as well as some of the specific ways to accomplish equity as well. Thank you.

COGLIANESE

Absolutely. So, I, at the beginning, kind of mentioned that we're going to be using not only the report done by this group, but also that Adaptation Action Area report and the Storm Infrastructure Review Committee report to kind of distill down all of those ideas make sure that we're not missing anything, and that we're capturing all the ideas that were generated through his processes. And, I think, to get to your question about equity and environmental justice, I actually think that that's one of the reasons why I think it's so important that we go through this methodical process of gathering data layers and using those as we're making decisions, because Jacksonville is massive, and there's going to come a time where we have to prioritize one thing over another in any given fiscal year. And so, I wanted to be very clear, not only internally to city staff, how those decisions were made, but to the public and make sure that people understand this is a reflection of risk over time and public benefits and that we're doing



OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

MATT CARLUCCI, SR.
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4
OFFICE (904) 255-5218
ECA (904) 255-5159
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

everything we can to maximize benefits for communities across Jacksonville. So, I think that this process we're designing with transparency in mind and with equity at the center of how we're making decisions.

CM DEFOOR

Ashantae, I don't know if you were here when she was talking about partnering with UNF and the heat study because I did not understand about heat until Ashantae Greene told me about it and what it meant to her and the community that she grew up in and it really was powerful. Um, Bruce.

BRUCE FOURAKER

Okay, so my question is partially involving the heat study. So, we already know within the city that within the urban core that there is less than 35% shaded area and in Northwest Jacksonville, which is another underserved area there's less than 45% shaded area and we know that trees in addition to helping with a reducing the heat island also in addition help with reducing the stormwater runoff. So, what are the plans once we get the results the heat study as far as determining tree plantings and different things within the urban core in Northwest Jacksonville?

COGLIANESE

It's a great question. I think certainly, like you said, trees have so many benefits and so I think that will be a both the heat study and some of the rainfall info that we're getting from the CDM study I hope will really shape where we focus tree plantings. And I'm starting some conversations with, you know, Director Pappas and others that are involved in the Tree Commission about how we can, you know, make sure that we're being effective with the funding through those, that process.

And the other thing that I will mention about the heat study I think when you when you hear he certainly tree and canopy is a main intervention, but it's not the only one. There's a lot we can do on energy efficiency. There's what we can do and how buildings are designed to have cool roofs. And there's a lot that other cities in Florida are starting to have conversations about and look at. And so, the hope is that I think that we'll be able to as an outcome of this study addressed in a very comprehensive way. Not to say that trees won't be a part of it, they're an incredibly important part of it, but it's just not the only intervention we'll be looking at because we do know that he is such an important has such an important correlation to public health. And so, I think we're going to be looking for numerous avenues that we can use to make sure that we're getting heat under control as this threat progresses.

CM DEFOOR

Thank you, and then we have one final person: John Nooney.



OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

MATT CARLUCCI, SR.
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4
OFFICE (904) 255-5218
ECA (904) 255-5159
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

JOHN NOONEY

Hello, my name is John Nooney. And I'm just hoping it's gonna get easier here. You know, when I was just listening to some of the comments, you know, with the bio, you know, and the tributaries. You know, I'm on Pottsburg Creek, and that's probably one of the biggest environmental disasters in the state of Florida, right now. It's just getting absolutely crushed. And, you know, December, or February 12 or 13th, Superbowl weekend, you know, the 3000 block of Parental Home Road, it was just clear cut right to the edge of Pottsburg Creek. And you know, and I went to, you know, the Environmental Protection Board, and, you know, I went through a whole bunch, you know, the Tree Commission, you know, there's 20 million bucks just sitting right there. So, you know, the whole thing about this tree, you know, planting trees and resiliency and stuff, but in the same breath, we are just wiping stuff out at an unbelievable accelerated rate that just makes your head spin.

You know, we're a mess. And so, anyway, here's my comments. You know, from the last Environmental Protection Board meeting, "John Nooney shared concerns with some parcels on Pottsburg Creek in the area of Parental Home Road." And then also public comment, "Doug Conkey introduced himself to the JEP Board as the new Intergovernmental Coordinator for the St. Johns River Water Management District and offered to assist the board anytime if needed." And the point I'm just getting at here is with this resiliency stuff you know, when you're talking about the entire county, you know, Pottsburg Creek, like I said, it's just been decimated beyond recognition.

And we just get back to with the Emerald trail. You know, I attended some of those meetings with the DIA and I'll tell you I'm just not feeling the resiliency. You know, there's going to be a City Council meeting later tonight. There's gonna be some pieces of legislation having to do with FEMA, federal, it's the top of the food chain. I am so... you want to bring... it scares the heck out of me. You know, manatees are dying. Well, you know what, and it on a whole different thing, I just hope you all get behind. You're [indecipherable] to feed the manatees.

You know, same thing with McCoy's Creek you I took people out kayaking, alligators, manatees, but we're going to be taken away that food source so anyway, you know, as far as and I've reached out to a bunch you don't like is the most frustrating thing. I've emailed so many don't hear back from anybody. So, the component of the public... like I'm not on any or I'm not on anything. I'm just Joe Q trying to show off to make our elected officials aware of these scenarios, and just get pummeled. So anyway, I wanted to share that with you.

COGLIANESE

Yeah. Well, thank you and I thank you for your comments. And I also think you brought up so many different issues in that comment. I think that's, you know, a great example of why we need a process



OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

MATT CARLUCCI, SR.
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4
OFFICE (904) 255-5218
ECA (904) 255-5159
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

that organizes so many different issues that are taking place and trying to find synergies. So, thank you for those comments.

CM DEFOOR

Thank you, Anne, and Mr. Nooney. And now I'd like to bring up my esteemed colleague, Michael Boylan.

CM BOYLAN

Thank you, Councilmember DeFoor. I'm not sure about the esteemed part, but I appreciate the reference. I'm here specifically to say thank you to a couple of folks. But before I do, a couple comments, if I could. I wanted to speak to the engage piece that I have shared with Anne and the idea of a Resiliency Council and the prospect of creating one of those, and I'm sure we'll have a chance to visit that down the road.

But I want to speak just briefly on the consequences of our situation. 18,000 families apply for FEMA applications after Hurricane Irma, which wasn't a hurricane just in Jacksonville, by the way. In North Florida, long-term recovery work that we did help thousands of those families in getting the kind of support they needed, except for those 100 families that we had to go out and raise money for to get their homes put back together again because they had no recourse to do that. Tonight, this very Council is going to be appropriating \$1.5 million of the Community Development Grant to help 33 families that are still impacted today by Hurricane Matthew. 33 families whose homes are still in significant disrepair after six years. So, what we're doing here is so critically important and being on the front row, and in the front seat to some of that work on the Hurricane Irma piece and seeing what it did to people's lives, their homes, their futures. The urgency of this, I can't impress upon all of us enough.

But with that, I do want to say a special thank you to a couple of folks. The folks at the North Florida Regional Council. Thank you, Sean Lahave, for your great work and what you did there. Jim Seaton, too. Both of those folks worked really hard on that report, and we really stand behind it. We were the faces in front of it, but we weren't the force behind it. You all were, so thank you for all of that.

Speaking of the force behind us, I also want to recognize Sheri Webber, as well as Brooks Dame, for the work that they do and supporting us, and particularly Matt and Councilmember DeFoor, in making sure this work gets done. I've enjoyed being part of this group from the very beginning, the first couple of meetings, and a founding member of this committee, as Mr. Councilmember Carlucci did. I'm looking forward to see it continue and I know that you've got a lot of Council members who are actively engaged in this process and will continue to do so. Thank you. I think with that, I'm introducing my esteemed friend. The front part, I'm not so sure about, but esteemed for sure. [laughter] Council member, come on up. Councilmember Dennis.



OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

MATT CARLUCCI, SR.
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4
OFFICE (904) 255-5218
ECA (904) 255-5159
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

CM DENNIS

Thank you, Councilman Boylan and my colleagues, and a big thank you to everybody for being here. I think since we came up with Zoom, I have readers [glasses] now, you know. I guess it's that age here, so please bear with me. [laughter] But before I read my little prepared statement, I do want to share just a quick story about Councilman Carlucci because when Councilman Carlucci came up with the idea of putting a committee together, he reached out to me, and he reached out to my office, and I ran it from him for weeks, it seems like. And I think we all did, you know, because we knew that if he came up with it and if he was trying to put a group of Council Members together, or he wanted to take charge of something that he was going to do a great job. He was going to bring the smartest people together to make a difference. So, I want to personally thank you for leading us in this effort. In saying that, he truly did put together a smart team to do this.

From my colleagues to the people, you know, that sat with us for 14 months. And I learned a lot. You know, as Council members, you know, we have a lot of things kind of going on. And my personality... I love to learn new things over and over and over. I just can't count widgets. And through this process we didn't count widgets. We learned a lot. I think we moved the needle for our city. So, thank you, Councilman Carlucci, and thank you to my colleagues.

In saying that, I'm gonna put on my readers now and read my little prepared statement. I would like to thank each of you for participating in this important work. Having the community, government, and subject [matter] experts offer their input has gotten the work done and will inform decisions made in the future. Keeping our finger on the pulse of our valuable environmental assets such as this will lead us to continue to strive to protect them by having open dialogue regarding an ever-changing process. So, on behalf of the committee and on behalf of the City of Jacksonville, I want to say thank you, and I think that's it. All right, y'all have a great... Oh, come on up.

COGLIANESE

We got right into answering questions. But I did want to just take a moment to thank all of the Council Members for having me here today to give this presentation. Thank all of you for coming and listening and for your drumbeat of action and, of course, a big thank you to Mayor Curry and under his leadership getting this started and being able to really move this forward and very appreciative to have been brought on and excited for what we're able to do. So, I just wanted to take one quick second to thank you all.

Transcribed by <https://otter.ai>



OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

MATT CARLUCCI, SR.
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4
OFFICE (904) 255-5218
ECA (904) 255-5159
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

Meeting Adjourned: 1:04 PM

Minutes: Prepared by Sheri Webber, Executive Council Assistant – At-Large, Group 4, 904-255-5159, swebber@coj.net

The written minutes for this meeting are an approximation of what was discussed and are not legally binding. This meeting was streamed live through the City Council website and a video is archived there (see link, page 1). Remarks were transcribed by A.I. and may not be verbatim.